

Chapter II

Chapter II

The Intrinsic Value of Animals

“... Earth’s life-giving environment is under direct threat” (BA 237).

It is believed that only human beings have values and other living beings do not have them. It is because only humans have goals, only humans have interests. It may be partially true or completely true. As a matter of fact, life and nature have not only values but also evince an interest to live as per ecological rules. Each human and non-human entity has their own intrinsic value. Several views on the meaning of intrinsic value can be distinguished. The intrinsic value of an animal states that the value it owns is its own right and this concept is completely opposite to instrumental value which degrades its value to other animals including human beings. The Dutch *Animal Health and Welfare Act* state that: “Acknowledgement of the intrinsic value of animals means that animals have value in their own right and as a consequence, their interest are no longer automatically subordinate to man’s interest” (Stoop)^[1].

During the second half of the twentieth century, the use of animals was regulated by prohibiting the activities of animals which were offensive to human beings. This type of regulation is anthropocentric. Only human beings were given importance and not animals. “The idea of a human-centred nature, or anthropocentrism, explicitly states that humans are the sole bearers of intrinsic value and all other living things are there to sustain humanity’s existence” (MacKinnon 331)^[2]. Later, several legislations started to arise from agricultural, economical, and veterinary motives against the extreme usage of animals in cattle breeding and in laboratory for scientific development. Many organisations started to

voice out for the voiceless animals used in farms and laboratories. They called up for new forms of law to put an end to utilisation of animals. According to the Dutch Federation of Veterinarians, regarding the welfare problem among domestic animals document states that:

Although the interests of animals often conflict with the demand of society, society remains responsible for the welfare of the animals involved. Considerations regarding animal welfare ought to be based on veterinary, scientific and ethological norms, but not on sentiment. And although animals do not have fundamental rights, human beings have certain moral obligations towards them. (DoI 30)^[3]

Subsequently in 1970's and 1980's the issue involving the living condition of laboratory and farm animals was mixed up with other environmental debates. The economic usage of animals became a significant issue and it became immense. In 1981, the Dutch government included the intrinsic value argument in a statement reflecting the protection of animals. Tom Regan is a critic of state intrinsic value in environmental ethics. It is the central concept in contemporary environmental ethics. The perception of intrinsic value can be viewed as an intellectual device in the struggle against anthropocentrism. The prominence of intrinsic value results from the strengthening of the way animals is being used and instrumentalised, especially during the last decades.

Most activists of the intrinsic value of animals will use it as the abstract opposite to instrumental value that is the economic value an animal has in its usefulness for humans. Singer who states that necessity of killing and experimentation on animals is in no way wrong. Contrary to Singer in *The Case for Animal Rights*, Regan is completely against killing and experimentation on animals. Regan states three things, that is,

“the total abolition of the use of animals in science, the total dissolution of commercial animal agriculture, the total elimination of commercial and sport hunting and trapping” (Regan 337) ^[4].

There are three forms of respect of the intrinsic value of animals. They are attitudinal respect, formal respect, and deontological respect. The attitudinal respect, for the intrinsic value of natural things, refers to an attitude of deference and awe but is not primarily concerned with interests, rights or duties. Rather, every being has its own interior, its self, its mystery, its numinous aspect, and to deprive any beings of this sacred quality is to disrupt the total order of the universe. The second formal respect, on the other hand, implies at least some concern with interests of animals and will grant animals certain basic rights. Deontological respect focuses on certain qualities fundamentally present in animals such as the telos of the animal, the basic needs of animals. It is on these qualities that rights of animals are based and founded and because of this animal deserve attention and care. As Aubrey Manning and James Serpell observe the role of animals in history and philosophy as,

Animals have been worshipped as gods, reviled as evil spirits, endowed with souls, or regarded as mindless machines. They have been killed for food with careful respect but also slaughtered for sport. Whilst some species have been objects of terror or loathing, others have been taken into our homes and treated as if human themselves. (Manning xi) ^[5]

Babylon's Ark is a tale about how Iraqis, a South African conservationist, and American soldiers saved the animals of the Baghdad Zoo. Early 2003, during the American led invasion of Iraq, the Baghdad Zoo was bombed, its animals were caged and

some were taken away illegally. Anthony saw the television footage of the bombardment of Baghdad and within days he was on the Kuwait- Iraq border to rescue the animals. He arrived in wartime Iraq after facing innumerable challenges. With a handful of helpers, he began the work of rescuing the surviving animals. They took steps to feed and hydrate the few remaining creatures. American soldiers too offered to help, giving the animals their MREs. They worked all day in one hundred and fifteen-degree heat. In addition, he and his team members saved lions and Arabian horses from Saddam's son's love nests. Finally, he could hand back a functioning zoo to the Iraqi people.

In our society, the term cruelty is becoming more powerful as days go on, as it is proven in the book *Babylon's Ark*. The cruelty towards the animals in the Baghdad Zoo is unexplainable. The book is analysed using the theory of intrinsic value formed by Tom Regan. It states three forms of respect towards animals by people, to analyse the respect, at first, it is necessary to know the wretched condition of animals in the zoo. Then only one can prove how three kinds of people helped the surviving animals as well as how they supported to develop the Al Zawra Park.

Anthony depicted the pitiable condition of the Baghdad Zoo animals to the society through his writings. He portrayed how the animals suffered in the hands of looters, the black-market dealers and even by the common people. These all are global issues which must be discussed. Animal suffering takes place not only in Baghdad Zoo but all over the world. Zoo diseased animals are not provided with proper veterinary care and at times are starved to death. Animals in the zoo have even died after intaking the plastic waste thrown into their coops by the public. Roadside zoos are regularly referred to for infringement, including the neglect and failure to furnish creatures with sufficient

veterinary care, filthy and unsanitary water repositories, and other poor or unsafe living conditions. Sometimes animals are tortured through the hands of caretakers also.

Animals are voiceless due to the exploitation of people. If animals are in the forest they are illegally poached and by slaughtering these animals for their body parts, push the specific species to the skirt of termination. To safeguard them from trafficking they were kept in zoos. A zoo is an ability in which animals are kept inside fenced-in areas, exhibited to people in civic and in which they may likewise breed. But humans do not allow them to exist tranquility. Many people whine that they are not permitted with water bottle or for taking sustenance inside for their unwinding, yet they are not worried about the zoo animals that are manhandled in the zoo.

The gruesome moment was when a Chinese zookeeper who had the impetus to push a live jackass into the jaws of three famished tigers. The frightened animal can be seen sticking on for dear life as labourers in waterproof shells push it down a slope and off a precarious edge into a tiger compound. In the wake of landing pitifully in the water, the jackass is soon assaulted by two adjacent tigers. The fierce predators - recognised to be kept at Changzhou Zoo in eastern China - cooperate to deny their prey of any expectation of escape. This activity of humans is a disgrace to the entire humanity.

In *Times of India*, an article titled, 'Coimbatore zoo animal feel the hunger pang', which reveals the Coimbatore zoo animals' appalling condition. The zoo animals suffered without proper food especially animals like camels and deer at the Coimbatore Corporation Zoo at VOC Park which is in a depressed dilemma as there has been a trouble in the supply of green grass to zoo animals. One of the zoo workers reported,

“There is shortage of grass to feed these animals, hence we are cutting the branches from the trees and feeding them. It has been like this for over a month now” (Coimbatore)^[6].

The zoo animals do not get a chance to graze. Those caged, helpless animals, many of them were taken from their natural territories, were not estimated in a society, instead were thrust into crisis. The Coimbatore Zoo depicts the reality of other zoos, even though there are various organisations and agencies voluntarily supporting and donating towards the development of zoo. Yet in many respects, it is still the animals that undergo suffering to satisfy their basic needs. Whereas Anthony, single-handedly succeeds in overcoming all the problems faced by the Baghdad Zoo animals.

When Anthony saw the television footage of the sufferings of Baghdad Zoo animals, he was reminded of Kosovo and Afghanistan Wars and the sufferings of animals during the wartime. During Afghanistan War, the reporters gathered to collect stories about the Taliban’s defeat and oppression of the public. The story of Marjan, the lion, fascinated many Americans in understanding the story of Afghanistan. The lion was gifted by Germany to Afghanistan in the late sixties when Kabul Zoo was under the control of Prince Nader. When the war broke out, it was an assault on Marjan and the other animals in the zoo. The animals which did not die of starvation ended up their lives in the hands of sadistic mujahedeen. (Petre)^[7]

The callousness of man is not only dangerous to himself but also to the other beings. A mujahedeen fighter who decided to prove his bravery, jumped into the lion’s den to tease the animal. Marjan promptly ate him. The mujahedeen who survived the battle with the Soviet Red Army was unable to survive the battle with the lion Marjan. As a revenge, the man’s angry brother threw a hand grenade into the enclosure. Marjan

mistook it for food and snatched the grenade. It burst out and it lost one eye and ninety-five percent of its sight in the other.

All the animals at the Kabul Zoo were regularly tortured by soldiers, who beat them with sticks and assaulted them with rocks and stones. It was also a favourite destination of Taliban soldiers who would go to the zoo and throw snowballs at the animals. The zoo staff has gone unpaid for several months and they begged in streets for food for the animals from the market stalls. The WSPCA had agreed to pay wages to zoo staff to provide them better animal husbandry training. Hence, Anthony did not want the Baghdad Zoo animals to face the same catastrophe as the Kabul Zoo animals did. He decided to mount an international effort to rescue the zoo animals.

Anthony did not know anything about Iraq war. But still, he wanted to save the surviving animals in the Baghdad zoo. He states about the miserable situation of animals as,

I knew nothing about Iraq and the politics of war. But what I did know was that in all human hostilities animals have suffered horrifically and often anonymously. Unable to flee or defend or feed themselves, they either were slaughtered wholesale in the initial assaults or died agonizingly from thirst and hunger later, locked and desperate in their cages. Or worse, they were callously shot by blood-crazed soldiers just for the hell of it. (BA 15)

Reaching the destination was not an easy task for Anthony. He met numerous people to get connected to the Baghdad Zoo. He sought help from Henry Richmond, one of his regular guests to Thula Thula (the game reserve which Anthony owns in South Africa) to move Iraq. He consented to do the needful however he required time to get

authorisation from coalition Central Command. Anthony, without declining time, directly spoke with them and got the authorisation to assume responsibility for Baghdad Zoo.

Anthony's courage and love towards the animals were proved when he refused to return. People and the soldiers in the war zone advised him to leave the place but he did not. Instead, he further moved forward. "Man, people are shooting each other there. For real. Forget about animals. You've got to worry about your own sorry asses." He gestured in front of us to the other side of the border. "Look at all these cars. Everybody else is trying to get out. And you want to go in?" (BA 2). It was a herculean task for him to cross all the security gates. In each gate, he had terrific experiences. The only explanation with him to traverse the thrush cross for good measure and he included that he had earnest supplies- including drugs- for the surviving animals. Despite everything, he had no clue as to what condition the zoo would be in.

The condition of the soldiers at the Baghdad was deplorable. They also looked like they were residing in an apocalyptic society. Anthony parked his car and got down to show his approval paper. On his way he closely witnessed the soldiers:

Stared at me with open mouthed curiosity. The tank was huge, vigorous monster of a machine, dirty and battle worn. Unlike the tensely wired soldiers at the first roadblock, this young crew- who looked and smelled as though they hadn't seen soap for months- was friendly, and a couple of them jumped down to shake hands. (BA 11)

The soldiers really smelled very bad and it was obvious as though they had just emerged from a rotten pit. They were continuously fighting for past three weeks. He did not even dare to breathe while talking to them. He enquired the soldiers about their

arrival and the persisting condition at Baghdad. They were very proud of their service toward the Bagdad Zoo. They killed so many innocent people for no reason. But they did not feel the pangs of guilt; instead, they were enjoying what they were doing. “Killed anything that came near us and plenty more” (BA 11). This act of soldiers proves the loss of humanity.

Human beings are not only cruel to the humans but also towards animals. When Anthony met the zoo’s senior veterinarian Dr.Meloc, he described the cruel activities of the soldiers during Saddam’s invasion of 1991. “Every single animal had been machine-gunned in cold blood. The Iraqi soldiers had done it for fun, he said” (BA 20). Mahatma Gandhi once wrote, “The greatness of a nation and its moral progress can be judged by the way its animals are treated” (Singh)^[8]. This proves the soldier’s cold-heartedness as well as the government role in nations development.

Anthony portrayed the environment with apocalyptic scenario. Along with Lt. Brain Szydlik, he went to visit the Baghdad Zoo and as soon he reached there he understood that the damage to the Baghdad Zoo was caused not only because of the battle but also of the looters. “It was looters. They had killed or kidnapped anything edible and ransacked everything. Even the lamp poles had been unbolted, tipped over, and their copper wiring wrenched out like multicolored spaghetti” (BA12). When they drove past, they saw groups of looters still standing to continue their next hunt. Looting is a never-ending process.

When Anthony witnessed the Baghdad Zoo, it was terrifying. The condition of zoo animals could not be expressed in words. The animal cages were stained beyond faith, nobody knew when it was cleaned, “Evaporated, ammonia-reeking urine formed

salty white patches on the ground, while piles of excrement, black and putrid, had hardened in the scorching sun. The stench was pungent enough to turn the strongest stomach” (BA 25).

In times of crisis, especially war, each person is on the lookout for personal safety and security. Naturally, they tend to neglect animals, especially those in the confines of a zoo. Anthony expresses his concern about these abandoned unfortunates. In the zoo, there were all kinds of animals like lions, giant cats, tiger, bear, monkeys, baboons, wild fox, lynx and different varieties of birds. All these animals wore a hopeless look, were very exhausted, skinny with no energy to live and of the six hundred animals, only these thirty-five remained intact. These animals saved themselves from the looters only because of their ferocious teeth and nails to fight back against them. For the birds, they had wings to fly off.

More vicious among the animals is an Iraqi brown bear which killed three looters and saved its own life. In the case of giraffes, tall and graceful of all creatures, were in a pitiful condition for they had arrived from Africa the day the war started. These animals were never even off-loaded. Husham informed that “One giraffe, he had heard, had definitely been killed and eaten. The other was probably in some cramped cage, unable to stand, waiting to be sold on the black market” (BA 27). Usually, the zoo is considered to be the sources of encouragement of animal torture. Unlike many other zoos, Baghdad Zoo’s animals were caged and went through mental torture and physical abuse as well. Anthony desperately felt deprived because of the miserable condition of the zoo animals. A lot of cages were empty as many animals were poached and dead of starvation.

When Szydlik met Husham, he was happy because Szydlik was a loyal person who could be trusted to look after the zoo. He explained to Husham that the lions had escaped from the cage when the mortar hit their confines. After the battle, they tried to catch the lions in that act. “They had been forced to kill three that refused to go back into their cages” (BA 31). Whether knowingly or unknowingly, animals were shot dead. Because they considered animals would not question them. The reason the zookeepers have taken back their jobs was for the love of animals. Some of the zoo staff came running when they saw their boss Szydlick. They were ready to return to their job when he ordered them. With the help of the staff, Anthony watered the lions by fetching the stagnant water from the canal. Husham portrays the visual picture of lion’s thirst. The pitiful situation is expressed in these words,

“Their desiccated tongues were too cracked and swollen to lap, so they buried their faces, open mouthed, in the precious liquid. Only when their parched palates had softened a little could they swallow. They drank and drank and drank.” (BA 32)

The marauders plundered whatever they found in the zoo. They looted donkeys’ meat which was kept in the zoo to encourage the rapacious animals. This began as a monotonous business of plundering donkeys’ meat from the zoo. “Any precious animal food not kept well out of sight was stolen on the spot” (BA 69). They even plundered the gear in the zoo, for example, essential planting devices, animals water bowls, basins, monster turbine and pumps. Notwithstanding, amid mid-evening, every one of the cans was stolen by the thieves. All this hardware were the vital things in the zoo which were used to dehydrate the animals. After that, he decided to carry the buckets along with him. This added an extra burden for him.

Anthony stayed with the soldiers in the Al- Rashid hotel. The hotel consisted of fourteen floors in which all the floors had one final flush in it. There was no running water in the entire city. It was an unpleasant condition. Soldiers and Anthony endured the circumstance and stood up till the end. Day by day confronted such a large number of difficulties, the issues appeared to pour in one after another, “Even though we now had an almost full staff complement, the daily search for fresh meat was becoming more and more arduous. At times we’d have to travel far into the desert to find donkeys for sale, and with the lions from the palace we now needed at least two a day” (BA129). Sometimes they could not get a donkey and the carnivorous animals went without food for a day, but never for two days at a stretch. And somehow, they managed to keep the situation normal by the ooze of water flowing into drinking troughs. According to environmental ethics, “It is defined a systematic account of the moral relationship between humans and the natural environment” (Stewart 154)^[9]. Be that as it may, man, never fretted over his co-accomplice. He felt awful about the demeanour of humans to beings anthropocentric:

Sadly, man has an obsession with keeping wild animals as pets or ornaments. Indeed, the illegal trade in animals is so vast that only drugs and arms trafficking are more profitable. It is cruel beyond words; all captured exotic animals are denied their freedom and a normal life for the amusement or financial gain of their barbarous owners and with few exceptions end up living miserable lives. Worse still, they are clearly treated as objects rather than living creatures. They can be abandoned as soon as they become inconvenient to their owner. (BA 94)

When Farah and Brendan came to know about the black-market dealer, they went to inspect the bear which was in Nameer's practice and was shocked to see its condition. She was only three years old and a half foot tall. She was confined in a small transport cage in which movement was impossible. The situation made the bear sicker, "A large suppurating abscess on her buttock- her "wounded ass"- was weeping with rancid puss, and sections of her back, flanks, and abdomen were scraped to bare skin from the tight fit in the cage" (BA 163).

When Farah and Brendan had conversation with Nameer, they came to know about the black market. He told that the bear belonged to Abu Sakah who was a prominent wild animal black- market dealer. When they met him and asked for the bear, his answer was unacceptable. He asked if the zookeeper knew the value of it and whether they would pay compensation for it. By this statement, it is obvious that nobody cared about the welfare of the animals but only about money matters.

During the Spanish Civil War, the zoo animals too experienced distressing situations. The short war had devastating effects that left Spain in ruins, many people died, and the zoos were ransacked. When the civil war came to an end in 1939, there were only twenty-five animals left alive at the Madrid Zoo and Aquarium. One inhabitant that lived at the zoo was an elephant, named Poncho. His tortured tale was reported in newspapers in the United States. The New York Times reported that "There was no particular happiness for the animals since, as much as the children may have wanted to, they were unable to throw them food of any sort. A few spared some stale bread crumbs for the ducks and monkeys, but the lone and very skinny elephant had only grass thrown to him" (Johnson)^[10]. Eight months later, the Washington Post reported, "Pancho, the

retired park zoo elephant who had thrilled generations of Madrid children, died today, a war casualty” (Johnson)^[11]. Poncho died of starvation, the human conflict had killed the giant mammal. The same elephant had once been the source of joy for innumerable children.

A German philosopher states that “The assumption that animals are without rights and the illusion that our treatment of them has no moral significance is a positively outrageous example of Western crudity and barbarity. Universal compassion is the only guarantee of morality” (Schopenhauer)^[12]. The cruelty towards these animals and how people out of interest came forward to help these animals were the two faces of human beings. In the present era, partly, people have realised their irresponsibility towards non-human as well as their utilisation of non-humans. It has pushed the world to enter an environmental crisis.

It is amazing to note that the Iraqis, the American soldiers, and Anthony rescued the animals of Baghdad Zoo using Tom Regan’s Theory of Intrinsic Value of Animals. The attitudinal respect comes to a person can be attributed to the respect and wonder towards the animals. They consider it is not their duty or responsibility to take care of the animals. Even though they did not consider it as their responsibility, humanity takes up the role. Being human, knowing the value of an individual life, whether it may be human or animal, it should be treasured. In a similar way, the public of Baghdad, American soldiers, and even the journalists paved way for the welfare of the animals.

The first attitudinal respect paid towards the animal was by Colonel McConnell. When he came to know about zoo animals, he immediately arranged food for the surviving ones. This was the best news to Anthony. When he had a conversation with McConnell he informed that, “The zoo was in dire straits and the few remaining animals

were at death's door, starving and critically dehydrated" (BA19). He supplied a load of buffalo meat to feed the surviving animals. This was not the duty of McConnel but still considering the plight of animals, he helped.

The American soldiers played a major role in saving the animals. They helped Anthony by providing ideas, information regarding animals at Saddam's palace and their timely help in transferring the animals to the zoo which were unexplainable. He, along with the soldiers at stayed at the Al Rashid Hotel. As the evening progressed, they started asking questions about the zoo. He informed them that they needed buckets. One of the photographers among the soldiers gave him the idea to utilise the hotel buckets to feed the animals. "I mentioned we desperately needed buckets to water the animals, and the photographers said no problem, there were some in the hotel" (BA 55).

Mosul's Montazah Al-Morour Zoo is minimal a little more than a modest handful of tarnished enclosures, however, this exclusive zoo was once home to more than forty animals – including lions, monkeys, and bears. At the point when the battling strengthened in October 2016, the attendants were compelled to surrender the zoo, leaving the confined animals to fight for themselves against starvation, shots, and bombs. By spring 2017, just two stayed alive: a female Syrian dark coloured bear named Lula, and Simba, a three-year-old lion. Khalil did what he could to balance out Lula and Simba. He got out their pens, which were covered with trash, and gave them nourishment and pharmaceutical supplies. It rapidly turned out to be evident that if the creatures were to survive, they expected to leave Iraq. Having prepared a modest bunch of nearby volunteers how to tend to the animals, Khalil came back to Vienna to make arrangements for their departure. But it was not an easy task for him.

Unlike animals, human beings have intuition which encourages them to feel satisfaction and distress of other beings. A man ought to be benevolent to animals as well to humans. If this humankind vanishes then there is only dimness. Al-Qaeda, ISIS, the renegades, who execute individuals for domain, for convictions, for exact retribution, for currency, for completing requests however it is all since benevolence and mankind have vanished. At long last, on the tenth day, after loads of battle, the animals crossed the fringes with the assistance of Khalil and his group Four Paws colleagues to its new home: The New Hope Center, an animal sanctuary. They were glad for their accomplishments.

Anthony approached the military to solve out the problem of looting, but they did not have rights to give specific patrol to protect the zoo. Even though the soldiers did not have any authoritative rights to guard the zoo, based on mortality, they volunteered themselves to help the zoo animals. They bought some sheep to feed the animals. “Their anger was aggravated when at the height of the problem a group of them arrived with some sheep, which they proudly handed over to me “for your starving lions and tigers” (BA 67).

When Khalil told the soldiers about the reason for their arrival, the initial response was usually ‘People are dying and you want the army to help rescue a bear?’ (Webb)^[13]. But people change when they spend a moment in the company of an animal. He saw soldiers putting down their weapons and drawing out their cameras for selfies. Similar officers who had whined were seen to part their food with the bear. One appropriated two chickens from a truck and stated that it is for the lion. From these two episodes, it is affirmed that soldiers assumed the significant part in the advancement of combat area animals as they helped these two zoos as well as a few battle areas.

Anthony discussed with the soldiers about the problems faced by the zookeepers. They had to work in the harsh heat to fetch water to the zoo animals and soon they became tired. The staff members became jealous of the animals. Because, like the animals, the staff too were starving. The animals were provided with meat but there was no food for them. When Husham informed him about the starving staff, Anthony became upset. “This posed a serious dilemma. It was pointless trying to run a zoo where the staff was as hungry as the animals” (BA 57). Later in the hotel, he discussed the dilemma to the American soldiers, after which he found a solution to this problem. Alistair took him to the basement of the hotel where was a plentiful supply of food left by the fleeing hotel staff. “There, as if by magic, sacks of flour, rice, tea, and sugar and hundreds of cans of food suddenly materialized . . . neatly stacked, abandoned by the fleeing hotel staff” (BA 62). The things which he got from the basement had fulfilled the hunger of the staff members.

Anthony requested Szydlik to operate a jail to put an end to looting. But he did not have the supremacy to do it as there were no courts, police or jails operating in the city. Later he agreed and decided to build a makeshift jail outside the zoo ground and to teach a lesson to the Alibaba. In the jail, the prisoners were happy because, “They were fed three MREs a day and given fresh water, something sorely lacking at home” (BA 68). By making the looters confine to the jail they thought it would make them stop from looting. But they were happy inside the jail filling their empty stomachs. He got one more snippet of good news from the soldiers that he had more animals for the zoo. Saddam and his son Uday had been passionate wildlife collectors. Their animals would be starving in the palaces. In the palace, there were three lions, a male, and two females. These animals were not starving because some way or the other the soldiers were taking care of these

lions. But they did not get enough food for their survival. When he witnessed these lions at first, he saw two cubs, so he decided to move them to the zoo.

Sumner became the pillar of the zoo because he was one of the reasons who stopped the people from looting. When Anthony informed him about the looting, he assessed the root cause of the problem. “Looting. We could buy or wrangle as much food for the animals as we liked, but if it was stolen each night, the project would collapse. The zoo’s creatures would die. Simple as that” (BA 108). To put an end to the looting, Sumner gave an excellent idea. Instead of locking the looters in the jail, he ordered that looters must be locked up in the big cage and to give each one of the scrubbing brush, to clean the cage. “... the looters scrubbed. And scrubbed, until the cage was as clean as it was going to get” (BA 109). The result was good as the looters learned a lesson and at the same time, the cages also got cleaned.

In the Luna Park, the animals’ situation was pathetic. The zoo looked like a desert. The animals were locked up in the zoo for so many days with no proper food or water. The condition of the bear was even more pitiable, “it was more than dry; it was filled with dust. No one could tell when the animals had last been fed or watered. He had been locked in that hellhole for five years” (BA 139). The park was already known for cruelty towards zoo animals. Added to this, there were press reports that staff prodded hyena with stick, to create a visual treat for the visitors and they were nobody to care about the public’s atrocities towards the animals like throwing chewing gums and chocolate bars to the monkeys. While they carried all the animals to Baghdad Zoo, people gathered all around and were excited, and they laughed and clapped. This shows the

responsibility of the public towards the animals. For the first time, after a very long period, Anthony saw happiness in the streets of Baghdad.

It is not only the zookeepers who helped the zoo animals, the public too helped them in every possible way. “They knew they could get into serious trouble for fuelling unauthorized vehicles, but whenever we thanked them, they would shrug: “You’re from the zoo. That’s for the animals” (BA 130). One day, one of the drunken soldiers left the car in the zoo and went out simply from that place. The good thing which he saw was a freezer, it was their solution to store the remaining meat. It was a voluntary help from the soldiers which resulted in forging ahead in their mission to save animals.

Man is a social animal who will not be able to survive without animals and his fellow beings. This is clearly unfolded by Anthony. Whenever he thanked Szydluk or the American soldiers for their role in supporting the zoo animals, their reply would be “because of the animals” (BA107). They paved respect for the animals and believed they should provide the animals with their basic rights.

When the Kuwaitis warned the Iraqis to move out of Baghdad, Husham and his colleagues decided to do so. Anthony felt it was difficult to survive without their service. Capt. William Sumner of the 354th Civil Affairs Brigade, accredited representative, became one of his companions and he too supported the zoo animals. Jeremy became a very good friend of Anthony, as he understood the problem of looting and he offered ““as a favor” to shoot a couple of looters dead, just to teach them a lesson. “It’s the only way,” he said. “Let us kill a few for you, and the word will soon get you. Your problems will be over, man”” (BA 132). But Anthony considerately declined this offer. Later Jeremy gave him his satellite phone number to contact him in case of emergency.

In Baghdad, always there was clatter of hooves hammering the street, and consequently, soldiers killed a horse, “With a sickening thud of flesh the steed crashed into the concrete, then bounced off, tangling and shredding himself in the wire barbs. The horse was killed instantly” (BA 171). The soldiers did not leave the carcass because every soldier in the city knew well that this protein filled flesh would feed the animals at the zoo. “The checkpoint guards extracted the ripped carcass from the wire, winched it up onto a troop carrier, and took it to the zoo” (BA 172). It was not the duty of the soldiers but out of care and concern for the caged animals. They carried the horse flesh to them. The American army, in its own efficient way, contributed towards the rescue of these trapped animals.

Apart from the American soldiers, two others volunteered help to protect the zoo animals. In the rescue operation of Saddam’s horse, Dr. Abu Bakker helped Anthony to locate the animals. He acted as an informer. He was Saddam’s chief equestrian vet and very closely intimated with the pets. He gave them clue that the horses would be in Abu Ghraib. It was about twenty miles west of Baghdad. The informer updated the information regarding the black markets. “The informer claimed forty-one Arabians were still in the area and being rudimentarily cared for” (BA 179).

A group of journalists arrived at the zoo to witness the meager condition of zoo animals. They took several photo clicks of the skinny animals in the zoo and carried the wrecked and wretched zoo animals all over the world through pictures, “picture spreads of bone-thin animals, smiling Iraqis, and me wearing a Thula Thula baseball cap” (BA 57). This shows the role of media in uplifting the zoo animals and showcasing to the

world their plight. After the news, many workers volunteered to help. Conservationists too came forward after the spread of news in the newspaper.

I knew news of the zoo's plight had leaked out via journalists who were swarming into the Palestine Hotel a few miles away, but there had been negligible contact from any of the international animal welfare bodies. I had presumed at the time that I was on my own because Baghdad's wild animals weren't actually in the wild and thus weren't as sexy as globally warmed polar bears. (BA 122)

The timely help rendered by common people, coupled with that of the American soldiers and higher officials helped Anthony to save the remaining surviving animals in the zoo. The common people's contribution would enlighten the society. This shows human sympathy and caring by inspiring the moral development of individuals to form a concerned, responsible society.

The second aspect of criticism is formal respect, which prompts some basic rights to the animals. There have always been several organisations voicing out their anger towards animal cruelty. In *Babylon's Ark*, various organisations came forward to rescue the surviving animals in the Baghdad Zoo. The first one was Stephan Bogner from Wild Aid Organisation. When he arrived there, he was shocked at situation as well as the racket of the gunshots. For the Baghdad people, the sound of gunshots was like regular music. After knowing the situation, he was not baffled, instead, he rendered help to save the zoo animals.

No one told me this was a war zone,” he said, alarmed. I laughed nervously. Gunshots, explosives, and the *crump-crump* of mortar fire were Baghdad’s music- the songbird of war. (BA 123)

The gory aspect of war is multi-faceted. When looting was taking place on one side, there were other problems that existed. The zoo staff did not get proper food; hence the food meant for the animal were hijacked to their families. Anthony tried hard to put an end to the starvation not only for the animals but also for the humans. “It was vital the staff know that even though our primary mission was to save the animals, we still placed humans first” (BA 127). Stephan offered ten dollars for the staff as their monthly wages. Later, the Coalition Administration decided to share Hussain’s property to the people of Iraq, the first preference was given to the zoo staff, because they were the ones who from the beginning struggled to save the zoo animals without expecting benefits.

Lynn Cuny’s *Through Animal’s Eyes*, tells more factual stories from the perspective of someone who not only cares for the animals but also not to force the animal to change its behaviour for human purpose. Lynn Cuny started Wildlife Rescue and Rehabilitation (WRR) in San Antonio in 1977. This organisation focused on “Accepting and caring for rehabilitating injured, orphaned, abused and displaced wild animals and returning them to their natural habitat” (Cuny i) ^[14].

Such organisations released the native animals back into the wild and those non-native or severely injured animals were kept as permanent sanctuary inhabitants. Through her stories, Lynn hopes to disperse the belief that animals do not have emotions, do not have reason, or show kindness for each other. She describes the orphaned baby Rhesus monkey who found a new mother, rescued from a lab to the brave red-tailed hawk who

was illicitly shot but healed to soar again. She discloses the pride of each animal, trying to survive in a cruel and dangerous world carved with the negligence of humans.

In *Babylons's Ark*, Farah who is like Cuny comes out from her space and start support the welfare of the animals. The SPCA (Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals) appointed Farah as the chairman. She was very sincere in her duties and she worked for free. She gave treatment to the animals and cured their wounds. Along with Brendan, she helped to find Saddam's Arabian horses as well to trace the black-market dealer.

Hard work is key to success and living up to this proverb, Farah and Brendan did not give up their willpower. They reached Abu Ghraib to trace Saddam's horses. They needed strong military power to pull the rescue mission. The Coalition Provisional Authority appointed Pat Kennedy who understood the importance of the situation and immediately arranged the needful for the rescue mission, "pledged a tank and troops to do the job" (BA 176). Their attempts failed more than two times. At last, they decided to move legally. They contacted World Arabian Horse Association and got permission to transport Saddam's horses to the Baghdad Zoo. To add fuel to the fire, many people were killed by the atrocities of the assassins. The town was in complete chaos. When the condition of the zoo animals became pathetic, Anthony decided to approach the South Africans guarding Gen. Jay Garner, the initial interim administrator of Iraq. Garner decided to visit the zoo and its occupants. Finally, he gave twenty thousand dollars to improve the condition of the zoo. He remarked the zoo as, "the only goddamn place that worked" in Baghdad" (BA 193). Randy Malamud in his zoo critical book *Poetic Animals and Animal Souls* states the way in which animals are exploited,

Animals are vehicles, burdened with the anthropocentrically symbolic projections of our own minds. We engage animals in a fashion that keeps them distinct from us, as we define ourselves against them. One could hardly imagine an orientation less amenable to harmonious and ethical coexistence with animals. Claude Levi-Strauss's dictum in *Totemism* that animals are good to think with ... describes a paradigm of imaginative exploitation. We conceive of animals as means to an end. (4)^[15]

Malamud goes on to observe that,

Our culture has conditioned us to expect that our animals will be copiously present to treat as we please: whether we want to eat them, or wear them, or dissect them, or just look at them. And in our aesthetic enterprises, we demand of animals a similar accessibility and ubiquity of service, as metaphors, symbols, vehicles, toys, fodder for contemplation, backdrops, flatterers of our omnivorous cultural grasp. Certainly, most literary representations sustain this conceit of the subject animal's availability, boundless pliability, and unproblematic implication in whatever text at hand happens to require a quack-quack here or an oink-oink there. (18)^[16]

For the betterment of the zoo animals, they received money from numerous organisations but the amount which they received was not sufficient, day by day their needs were increasing. The newspaper spread the news like wildfire all over the world, but funds did not pour in. "So, the struggle for survival continued hour by hour, day by day. From keeping water flowing with spluttering pumps to lugging buckets of detergents

and scrounging for food, the daily routine was relentless” (BA 193). Later the news was published in the regional South African newspaper, the *Zululand Observer* where the newspaper director and editor-in-chief were Anthony’s mother, Regina Anthony, who too supported the animals rescue mission. Sarah Scarth, the International Fund for Animal Welfare (IFAW), she read the news and immediately contacted Regina to understand the real condition of the animals as well to get the confirmation from her. Regina was in regular contact with her son. Hence, she gave the detailed description about the situation of Baghdad zoo. Immediately, the international Emergency Relief (ER) team rushed to Iraq. They fulfilled the animal’s needs:

A few weeks later the first convoy of trucks rolled into Baghdad carrying three tons of food; essential medical supplies such as drip feed kits, suture kits, drugs, and antibiotics; building equipment such as angle grinders, welding machines, and electrical and plumbing parts; and gallons of detergents and pesticides. (BA 194)

Later members from IFAW came forward to guard the zoo; some of them were logistics experts like Maritte Hopley and Amed Khan, Jason Thrupp a veterinarian from New Zealand, Jackson Zee, a zoologist who manages IFAW’s Moon Bear Sanctuary near Hong Kong and Ashraf Kunhunnu, a wildlife veterinarian from India. All their efforts culminated in success because of the interest and contribution of the media.

Anthony wanted to connect the Baghdad Zoo with the American Zoo and Aquarium Association, who could work closely with the Iraqi administration. AZA is one of the most respected zoos in the world. They provide international standards and support them in transforming the zoos into habitats, rather than caged environments. Each member did

their best to support the surviving animals. Brendan and Ashraf, IFAE's Indian vet, drew up scientific feeding programme for animals. Later Mariette Hopley tackled her job with Herculean energy. She gifted a new black SUV to meet the requirements of zoo. An army officer, Brain Hoyback, arrived at the zoo and expressed his pleasure in bringing his child to the zoo. The conversation with him made to understand the situation and he came forward to help the zoo by sponsoring fifty thousand dollars with the CPA's Baghdad Central office which was handed over to the zoo.

Summer spread over the good news that "the coalition was acting on my proposal "big-time." A tentative budget of \$250,000 was set for restoration work, and the military was instructed to send in its crack engineering unit, the Second Brigade's Fortieth Engineer Battalion" (BA 202). After the arrival of so many organisations, the condition of the animals changed whereas, earlier there was no one to care about them but now it changed, "we had antibiotics to treat our sick and injured animals holistically. It was no longer a case of ministering to life-threatening wounds and illnesses with basic antiseptics or whatever else we could scrounge" (BA 195). Thus, with all these organisations the development of the zoo was in advancement.

In accordance with Tom Regan's point of view, "creatures with inherent value must be treated as ends in themselves, not merely as means to an end" (Vaughn 562)^[17]. The third form of respect is deontological respect, which focuses on the issue of interpreting how animals should be morally treated compared to human beings, and how much of moral concern humans owe them. Anthony was in the practice of protecting animal species and their habitats. His goal was to safeguard nature which would be around for future generations as well. He wanted to awaken people to the well-being and

importance of animals. When he reached Baghdad, he repeated the question asked to him everywhere which was, “You sure you gonna take charge of these animals?” (BA 24). It is then that he met Husham Hussan, the deputy director of Baghdad Zoo. When Husham came to know about Anthony, his mission and the medical supplies he had brought, he becomes emotional and grabbed Anthony’s hand and wept. He felt pleased as someone had come forward to help the zoo animals. This proves his love towards the inhabitants of the zoo.

During the wartime, the zookeepers were regularly doing their duties without expecting anything in return. But they were stopped by the *fedayeen*. The zoo’s director, Dr. Adel Salman Mousa, pleaded to the young aggressive *fedayeen* to give little more time to feed the animals. They declined permission and threatened them with grave consequences. After *fedayeen* warning, Adel, Husham, and the rest of the staff frantically distributed the last of the food to the animals and filled the water troughs to its fullest. They did it silently, depressed beyond words. “They believed they would never see their animals again” (BA 28-29). The animals not only suffered due to lack of food but were also distressed by the noises during the wartime.

I could picture with brutal clarity the horror the animals must have suffered, bullets ricocheting off their cages, turbine- engine tanks at full roar with their steel tracks ripping up roads, missiles whistling from the sky, and cosmic- clapping bombs shredding buildings. However, petrifying it must be for humans, it would be unimaginably worse for animals trapped in cages. (BA 29)

Similar things happened to the Gaza's Al-Bisan Park zoo animals as well. A war-torn place is not the safest of places to exist for both humans and animals. During the most recent rounds of fighting between Israelis and Hamas, the Gaza's Al-Bisan recreational park was largely damaged, and the reason for the death of many animals was gunfire. The zoo veterinarian Abu Sameer stated that "Eight to ten monkeys were killed. Also, a peacock, a gazelle, a lion, and a fox" (Kiernan)^[18]. Others then died of poor conditions and due to starvation. Other creatures which survived were traumatised by the noise and destruction, then left to live with the rotting corpses of their dead cage mates. Since then, the animal aid organisation Four Paws has stepped into rescue animals, including several lions.

In Baghdad Zoo, the zoo keepers contribution played a major role, without whom Anthony could not have succeeded. The keepers did not mind the heat that soared to one hundred degrees Fahrenheit. They used only what they had; muscle, courage, and a bucket; with these things, they fed the remaining animals at the zoo. Everybody worried about the condition of Baghdad zoo animals but none came forward to help the surviving ones. "Reality was starkly different: a handful of us armed with a leaky pipe and a rusty bucket was all that stood between life and death for some of the planet's most magnificent creatures" (BA 34).

Anthony laid the plan to start their work. He followed certain steps in the rescue mission. The first step was to bring water with the help of the staff members. "Water is life" (BA 49). The next thing was to feed the animals, for that they had the meat of buffalo and the third thing to determine which animals needed medical attention. To provide emergency treatment for the wrecked zoo inmates required urgent care.

Hygiene was the last priority, they would have to clean the filthy cages. The keepers of the zoo had other pressing matters to attend to as well. To provide water for the animals was their important task. Throughout the morning, the staff worked in temperatures steaming up to one hundred ten degrees Fahrenheit. They were little more than beasts of burden, drawing bucketful of stagnant water from the canals. They did not have proper buckets, they carried water with the rusty cans. It took ages to complete the thirst for a single animal. “If we didn’t sort the pumps out soon, more animals were going to die as my ill-fed men dropped from exhaustion. It was as simple, or difficult, as that” (BA 53). None of the zookeepers volunteered to water the caged animals. It was considered as one of the most difficult tasks to do. Later, Anthony announced that whoever comes to fetch water would be provided American dollars in cash. He understood the situation and acted tactically to fulfill the second step.

Anthony explored every possible arena to garner help. Along with Dr. Husham four more zookeepers came to help. They had taken their lives into utmost risk for the sake of zoo animals because they were warned earlier that nobody should be allowed inside the zoo by the *fedayeen*. He treated these people with utmost care and respect as they had risked their lives to save the animals. “This was something precious build on, and I knew that to foster fragile morale I had to keep them productively occupied” (BA 47). As in the case every crisis, gradually people returned to their routine. Being South African, Anthony did not know the language of local people, hence to communicate with them as well to boost up their energy, he appealed pointing at the zoo as, “Speaking slowly in basic English, I pointed to the animal cages around us. Every one

of these creatures, I said, depended on us. Every single one. It was up to us whether they lived or died” (BA 47).

It is believed that humans have the responsibility to all-natural life on earth because, apart from being the most consuming species of all, they possess the talent to think and perceive the earth. Anthony stated, “We lived in a world, I continued, where the environment and animals were viciously abused and soon we are going to pay a terrible price for our neglect” (BA 48). Like his, Jihad Jumaa, a zookeeper, and son of Rafah zoo’s owner deeply cared about the zoo animals. Not only him, but his whole family tried hard to keep the zoo functioning. He stated “It’s our source of life, I was raised here and will continue to work and fight to keep it open” (Odgaard)^[19]. The zoo was located few kilometres away from the Israeli and Egyptian borders. This zoo was also several times attacked when Israeli tanks devastated large parts of the neighbourhood.

Many of the animals were killed in the Rafah zoo and it took ten years to the family to reconstruct it from ruins. During the fifty-first day of Gaza war, the zoo experienced another blow. As Jumaa and his brother were watering the zoo’s cats, the surrounding area was hit by Israeli rockets. The young men were badly wounded, and the zoo’s tiger, baboon, raccoon, kangaroo, and several jaguars were killed. To bring self-confidence among the staff members Anthony asked each one of them to share their experience. The first one to come was Adel. He said, ““Nobody care about zoo or animals, or people working here, nobody help, everybody fighting, but we try. My wife also she help; she wash your clothes”” (BA 48). The staff members of the Rafah zoo needed their jobs, they had to take care of their family. Their wife and children were as hungry as the starving animals in the zoo. Each man represented the same issue. Anthony

decided to stop the hunger of staff and only by doing it they would be able to provide their service to the animals. “We will do what we can, right now, using whatever we’ve got right here in the zoo. And we will make it go right, whatever happens” (BA 49).

The Giza Zoo was founded in 1891, used to be one of the popular zoos in all of Africa. But today the condition of the zoo is reversed. Animals were kept in crowded coops and are rarely trained. To visit the zoo, the visitors were charged very highly by the zookeepers only to fill their wallets. Nobody came forward to rescue the zoo animals because of the shameful behaviour of the zoo staff. The zoo was disqualified from the World Association of Zoos and Aquariums in 2004. In the zoo, an elephant’s foot was chained to avoid walking around. The chained area of the animal’s skin was worn away.

The lion paces around the 2 metre-by-2 metre cage at Giza Zoo, observing the throngs of Egyptians peering at her through iron bars with tired eyes. A group of teenage boys pulls out a play shotgun and starts firing off plastic bullets. She flinches, and thrashes at the bars. The pellets ding her on the nose, next to her eye, her legs. Over and over again they fire, as a crowd gathered and started cheering for more. Nearby, a zoo keeper watches the lion, back to the audience. (Nader)^[20]

The Baghdad zoo staff were far better than Giza Zoo staff in Africa. They buckled down for the improvement of zoo creatures. Despite the fact that they stole the zoo equipment, it was only to fulfil their empty stomach but whereas in Giza they did it for entertainment.

Every day there was a new challenge to be confronted. Anthony along with the staff carried on their regular work. But by mid-afternoon, their buckets were stolen by the

looters. He did not know what to do further. A group of newspaper journalist arrived at the zoo. They saw the situation and enquired about what they saw. They sarcastically asked Anthony about the situation that how he could able to save the animals. He answered, ““Simple,” I said. “we want to save these animals. It’s not their fault they’re in the shit.” He laughed and shook his head. “they’re not even going to save this city. How’re you’re going to do it with a bloody zoo?”” (BA 56). The next morning the newspapers blew out the news all over the world, and few more staff joined the zoo after they saw the information that staff would be paid.

Food plays a vital role in an animal’s life. In case of wild animals, an animal normally spends all day hunting for food but this situation is impossible in zoo. “We could feed every animal in the zoo just dry pellets and biscuits” (Pressler)^[21]. He began with feeding the animals for which they needed meat and this was sponsored by Szydlik. He also gave permission to store the remaining meat in two small deep freezes in Hussein’s palace. Anthony decided to buy donkeys to continue feeding the carnivores. He gave dollars to an unknown person for this purpose but quickly he ran out of money. Next time onwards, he investigated keenly whether the person belonged to the zoo and then he paid for it. This incident portrays man’s irresponsibility towards saving nature.

Anthony distributed meat for all the carnivores. Some were fed the fresh meat, others with the remaining vegetables and others with the MRE’s. To lure the hidden animals, some meat was left open in the ground, so that the scent of the meat would make them come forward to have their feed. He paid more and more money to feed the carnivores in the zoo. Nevertheless, feeding donkeys did not make him bother about the ethics, his only motive was to save the carnivores. Other conservationists argue about his

act as, “Many conservationists have subsequently queried the ethics of killing one animal to keep another alive, but the Baghdad Zoo’s carnivores had always feasted on donkey meat, under the simple premise that donkeys were plentiful and lions and tigers few” (BA 63).

Steven Best, an activist like Regan who fought for total the liberation of animals from human usage. Best in his article, “The Killing Fields of South Africa: Eco-Wars, Species Apartheid, and Total Liberation” argues that,

Instead of confronting systematic violence against animals as a profound problem with enormous implications for humans themselves, the brutality of species apartheid is linguistically sanitized in the discourse such as ‘culling,’ ‘sustainable use,’ ‘sustainable off take,’ ‘humane use,’ ‘harvestable resource,’ ‘adaptive management,’ and ‘population management’. (Mthatiwa 27)^[22]

Their main motives were foraging for food, moving animals from Uday’s palace, fetching water into the cages. In addition to all these responsibilities, one more task added to their routine and that was to clean up the cages. For this, Anthony needed detergents but it was unavailable throughout the city. One of the soldiers gave him the idea to search the hotel’s storeroom. To enter a storeroom was not an easy task because it was constantly guarded by the soldiers. He used his satellite phone to bribe the homesick soldiers. He offered it to them and when they moved out to talk over the phone he entered the storeroom and picked up the necessary things.

The important thing which Anthony got from the storeroom was the essentials which he was in urgent need of, “...the biggest bonanza was finding large barrels of high-potency industrial detergent and disinfectant as well as stiff- bristle brooms, mops, and

scrubbing brushes. It was better than stumbling upon diamonds” (BA 116) because hygiene was one of the basic things which animals needed. With a rigid hygiene programme now in force, he knew the howling wounds and filthy sores that had been decaying on most of the animals would slowly begin to heal. The measures which he took up to clean the zoo should be appreciated because of which animals stayed in a clean and hygiene enclosure.

Anthony gradually found progress in his action. He felt pleasure in feeding the animals but looters posed as barriers. He was fed up with them. “Enough was enough. It was clear to me that something had to be done. Every bit of progress we made was reversed through brazen theft. Unless we confronted the rampant looting problem, the zoo would perish” (BA 63). To overcome this challenge, he sought help from the soldiers to patrol the zoo. Day by day, the looting increased in number. Families too started to loot the zoo equipment. He confronted them and advised not to repeat such offenses. Anthony did not know the language of the local people, hence the conversation between them was very poor but through non-verbal communication, he conveyed his thoughts to them. ““Why? This is your zoo. Why do you steal?” ... “Buy food for your children. But don’t steal from your zoo”” (BA 65).

At Garold Wayne Interactive Zoological Park in Wynnewood, Oklahoma, around seventy miles south of Oklahoma City, a lion spends his days playing and cuddling with some strange companions. Bonedigger may be a five-hundred-pound glorious lion with a scary name. Joe Schreibvogel, normally known by the name Joe Exotic, is an animal master, lawyer, and representative for the zoo. Exotic clarifies that the enormous lion and his wiener pouch mates all grew up together. At the time when Bonedigger arrived at the

zoo as a small four-week-old offspring, Exotic chose to have a go at something somewhat eccentric, he presented his four youthful Dachshund pups to the smallish lion cub, wanting to give a few companions to the forlorn lion. Intriguing could never have expected the unbreakable bond Bonedigger would produce with his pooch friends. More than ten years, they were more seasoned and Bonedigger and his Doxie pack are indivisible.

Exotic said, “The dogs thought it was just a big puppy and have loved each other since” (Dachshund)^[23]. Bonedigger is not simply bizarre due to his decision inmates. At the point when the enormous lion was only a fledgling, he was determined to have a crippling metabolic bone infection, a condition that has abandoned him somewhat incapacitated. Exotic trusts it is mostly a direct result of his inability that Bonedigger has associated so firmly with the Dachshunds. While Bonedigger is close with the greater part of the canines, who eat a similar crude meat, eat fewer carbs as their lion sibling, cuddle up to him during the evening and even copy his lion thunder, of whom Doxies, Angel, and Milo are particularly dear to the submissive feline.

Like Bonedigger and Dachshunds unusual friendship, a comparable incident took place in Baghdad Zoo also. Anthony got the information from the soldiers that some of Uday’s pet animals still existed in the zoo. The effort which Anthony took to transfer the animals to the zoo is unexplainable. After a lot of difficulties, they transferred all the animals from the palace to zoo. “Suddenly my mind was made up. “We can do this,” I said firmly, hoping to inspire as much confidence as I could. “We must do it.” Husham and Abdulla nodded, and I was heartened by their positive attitude” (BA 85). Even during these crucial times, the togetherness of the lions and dogs evinced how animals are far

better than humans. In Uday's palace, in the lion's cage were two dogs as well, which made everybody to wonder about their coexistence. The carnivores did not taste the flesh of dogs. It may be a haunting situation which made the animals to understand the pathetic situation they were in and they would have become friends. Despite starving, the lions did not consider the dogs as their prey.

There was no explanation why the starving lions had not already killed and eaten the dogs. We guessed it was because the animals had huddled together through so much terror during the bombing raids that they had bonded in a way only nature could fathom, forging some mystical affinity that transcended the torment of hunger. (BA 84)

The friendship between the lions and dogs were caused due to the bombardment. Uday's palace was the main target for the soldiers, hence these animals would have closely experienced the war. The sound of explosions all around should have made the animals seven more ferocious but in Uday's palace, it was just the opposite. Maybe the lions were starving for so many days, hence, they did not have enough energy to attack the dogs. It was mystical, to starve rather than eat their friends. It was a rare incident but a welcome situation of sympathy in the toughest conditions. Such instances and contrasting ones occur in zoos the world over.

The battle between humans caused all the Sarajevo Zoo animals to die except for a female bear. There were at least a hundred animals like lions, leopards, and the wolves. The last animal to live in the barrier, the bear, finally surrendered to starvation. Some of the visitors brought her apples but she was too weak to eat even that. Most of the zoo's other animals turned themselves to cannibalism and played upon their own mates to

escape from hunger. One of the taxi drivers in the war zone, Adem Hodzic said that “Many of us are dead and almost everybody is hungry, but I feel more sorry for the animals than for the people,” (Burns)^[24].

People too turned themselves into cannibals to escape from hunger but in Uday’s palace, the lions were starved to death. Despite this, they did not feed on other animals in the enclosure. Anthony felt pity for the animals. It did not take even a minute for him to open the cages and let the animals free before they fled. “I looked at the lions and a feeling of pity and desperation came over me. These poor creatures, I thought, owned and abused by a cruel dictator, caged in alien surroundings far from their natural environment, afraid and intimidated, and yet there was still fight in them. They still had spirit” (BA 85). The bond which these entrapped animals had for each other is wondrous.

Whereas in the Kiev Zoo, one of the largest zoos in the former Soviet Union, which was similar to Baghdad Zoo, many animals died due to various reasons. It was first founded in the year 1909 by the Nature Lovers Society. When the thirty-nine-year-old elephant of the zoo died, followed by a camel, and a bison, it created a controversy when a series of animals died. The zoo authorities were the reason behind the deaths. An elderly brown bear called Dinara was earlier caged with a male Malayan sun bear in a large enclosure but later it was transferred to a small one. It was stressed because of the unfamiliar surroundings, began to bang its head repeatedly against the walls leaving bloodstains everywhere. After a week, she was put to death. In the zoo, more than fifty animals have died due to malnourishment, maltreatment, and lack of proper medical care. After all these crises, a new manager was appointed and he stated that,

Nearly half of the zoo's animals either died or mysteriously disappeared over two years under their predecessors, and a government audit found that thousands of dollars were misspent as animals were illegally sold and funds earmarked for their food and care disappeared. Ukrainian prosecutors have also opened an investigation. (Shocking)^[25]

Like Dinara, in Uday's palace, lions were kept in a spacious place so they were quite normal whereas cheetahs were kept in tiny pens hence they were in terrible state, they were unable to move inside the cage. The zoos vets immediately treated the animals which were transported from the palace. Like Regan's Deontological reasoning, to solve the issue of animal's rights, individuals need to realise that "prohibition not only forbids cruelty against animals, but it also obligates humanity to promote the good of other animals." (Goulet)^[26]. After the successful transformation of animals to the zoo, Anthony got additional information about "Udays love nest" (BA 93). When he, along with two Kuwaitis, Adel, and Husham, reached the place to investigate further, he saw a series of cages and was shocked to witness the condition of animals inside the cage.

"“Monkeys,” he shouted. “All dead.” Somehow I managed to extricate myself from the glutinous sludge and sloshed over to him. It was wretched sight. Six or seven emancipated green monkeys lay huddled against one another on the floor, killed by thirst. They had been locked in the cage and left to die. (BA 93)

Anthony saw a baby monkey struggling to survive and expected it to escape from the cage during the bombardment. While returning after investigating all the pens, the baby monkey was waiting for them and he alluded it with another apple, thinking that he

would be able to cajole it into the car. He was happy that the animal would get a good new home and a new future at the zoo. Along with these animals, there were three ostriches and four or five peacocks. The animals and birds stared at them with dull eyes, which only reflected the trauma they had undergone. He provided water for the birds. He decided to transport these birds the next day. But unfortunately, the gang of night looters came and they smashed the lock of the cage. Fortunately, ostriches escaped from them but the monkeys and peacocks were seized. “The beautiful birds had their necks twisted and were sold as meat” (BA 97). The orphaned monkey would have been kept in cramped cage or it may also have been eaten. Anthony pitied these caged animals. He realised his responsibility to save the animals but before he could do anything the animals were looted. “Morality is a matter of getting along with one’s fellow creatures as well as possible. All beliefs are provisional, subject to change when they fail to produce harmonious consequences” (Meeker 167) ^[27].

Whatever happened, Anthony was firmly determined to succeed in his goal. The Kuwaitis were asked to leave the zoo immediately. The zookeepers, Abdulla, and his colleagues were also Kuwaitis. Their lives were in danger they had to immediately rush out of Baghdad. They forced Anthony to accompany them but he refused. According to him, whatever happened he would be firm in his decision. “I shook my head. If I left now, I might as well do what had originally crossed my mind: shoot all the animals. There was no way the zoo would survive without our help and our collaboration with soldiers” (BA104).

Anthony refused to go and he offered them his rented car as transport. “I consider again my reasons for coming here. For me, this was more than just about saving a zoo.

It was about making a moral and ethical stand, about saying we cannot do this to our planet anymore” (BA 105). His decision was profound and was to set others an example. It would also inspire people to respect and care for animals for their own sake. “A responsible, influential stand had to be made against mankind’s irrelevance for other life-forms” (BA 105). When Abdullah forced him to join with them, he said pointing to the nearest cage. “If I leave, he will die” (BA105). Every day stay at the zoo was not an easy task, it was filled with danger, no source of food, needed several hands to lug water from the canal, and to keep away as many looters as possible. If he decided to leave, then the project would collapse.

Of the major problems they confronted, water was their primary target which was fulfilled by Husham’s intelligence by finding a water motor. Once the water rushed out from the motor, the moment was energised by shouts and applause. Everybody believed nature had a very silent role in the ecosystem but when the water was supplied to the animals, they felt fresh. Man has made a fence between the human and non-human, “the status of being a speaking subject is jealously guarded as an exclusively human prerogative” (Manes 15) ^[28]. Anthony expressed the joy of animals,

We turned the water onto the animals, especially the shaggy-coated bears and Bengal tigers that particularly felt the heat. Each creature got a long, cool shower, with dirt and grime sluicing off in solid chunks. The bear even changed color, from sooty black to chestnut; the tigers, from brown to orange and golds. (BA 127)

When Anthony and his staff witnessed the freshness in animals, they considered it as a reward from heaven. He later learned about the Luna Park which is in the red zone.

Along with the TV cameramen he went inside to analyse the situation. Inside, it was not soothing, and as soon as he entered the park, a person claimed that he was the proprietor and he would not allow anybody in. He became furious and shouted and flipped, “In other words, when you bloody well know how to look after animals properly” (BA 136). Rescuing these animals posed great difficulties. The condition of the animals in the Luna Park was worse than at Baghdad Zoo. Several animals were starving. At first, Anthony and his team decided to transfer the camel to Baghdad Zoo. The way it quenched its thirst cannot be adequately described by words:

We then have him some water and he drank. And drank. And then he drank some more. I thought camels weren't meant to get thirsty, but this one couldn't get enough. With much pushing, cursing, and shoving, the camel was loaded onto the Humvee. (BA 141)

Anthony portrayed the importance of water through the thirst of caged animals. The way in which the animal intake water after a period of starvation, was touching. Of course, there is a relationship between humans and the physical environment.

The little Maltese were so dehydrated I poured water through the wire mesh directly into their mouths. They soaked it up like sponges- and were still thirsty. It was absolutely pathetic watching them desperately trying to grab at the bottle with their teeth, terrified I would snatch it away.

(BA140)

Animals were locked up in the cage and the Luna Park staff did not have the keys with them, so they had the urge to crack the locks off. The animals were frightened by the noise, they were screaming and jumping inside the cages.

The ordeal of rescue seemed to continue. In the second half of the rescue mission of the Luna Park, the animals transferred were the huge brown bear, a striped hyena, a bobcat, two badgers, and some pigs. For the rescue operation of the Luna Park animals, Anthony summoned Brendan Whitting-Jones from Thula Thula. After so many hurdles, the latter reached the war zone area. Subsequently relocating animals to Baghdad zoo, they were far better when compared to their earlier condition. Anthony travelled to Kuwait to create an awareness of the calamitous condition of the Baghdad Zoo to the public. The zoo team members in Baghdad were getting ready to rescue the three-year-old wounded bear, popularly called as Last Man Standing, the only one left in the Luna Park. Their operation was not an easy task. They tried so many tactics to remove the bear, such as Brendan using his dart gun hit the bear, but it was of no use. They darted the bear thrice, but it did not doze off.

One of the Luna Park zookeepers informed them that, “previous zookeeper regularly spent their evenings guzzling beer with the bear, often getting the creature blind drunk” (BA152). The wicked behaviour of the zookeepers must be punished severely. It is not that only organisations must come forward to save the lives of animals. It is individual’s responsibility to save nature. At last, they tried for the fourth time but they could not succeed. Finally, they decided to move on, considering it was their bad day. Sumner was called up by the general who did not have any connection with the zoo to inquire about their rescue mission. His care proved his responsibility towards the caged bear in the Luna Park. Next day, they handled a new method, by tempting it with food, but did not get the desired effect and later Brendan sprayed some water into the cage, but it also failed.

Finally, after placing vegetables, honey- even MREs- in the mobile cage to no avail, someone discovered week- old scorched rice scrapings in a fire-blackened pot used by the Iraqi staff. These were added to the growing pile of food treat as a last resort- and to the astonishment of all, the bears sniffed the air for a few second and then rushed in to devour the scraps. (BA 158)

At last, successfully they could move the bear to the cage. In awfully perilous armed- conflict situations, used homemade equipment, basic cages with hardly functioning wheels, the rescue team managed to move the starving, dangerous, wild animals from conditions of dreadful uncleanliness to as decent a home as possible. Not all zoo staff were dedicated and responsible. Nameer depicts the irresponsibility of zookeepers. The staff serially tortured the bear which proved that he did not really care or love the animal. The bear was temporarily kept at Baghdad zoo, before it could be moved to the black market and was tortured to the core, “Whenever they wanted her to move they just banged on her cage or poked her with iron rods, forcing her to stand on her rotten paws. There was no doubt her life depended on us getting her to the zoo as quickly as possible” (BA 166). Ten people gathered to visit the caged bear at Nameer’s clinic. They did not admire the bear or feel pity for its pathetic situation, instead, they tortured the animal to the core, “Making a hell of a noise and banging the cage, stressing the already- panicked creature no end” (BA 167). Brenden tried to stop them, but by then the bear became drowsy.

Anthony came to know about the forty-one horses which belonged to Saddam’s but was missing. They vanished from Saddam’s palace during the early bombing raids.

If they had escaped from black marketers, then they have been found wandering in the streets. He decided to rescue them. “what started off as mild curiosity grew into an almost obsessive quest. It was my duty, I believed, to trace this national treasure- particularly as everyone else seemed so indifferent” (BA 173). To rescue the horses from black marketers they needed proof. Farah and Brendan drove to Abu Bakker’s house to uncover the documentation about Saddam’s horses. Finally, they rescued the horses from black markets. The zoo team members, took an oath to safeguard the nation’s pride, “Although everyone agreed that the herd was a genetic gold mine and national assets, enthusiasm tended to diminish rapidly whenever the cost of their upkeep was mentioned” (BA 185). He felt immense satisfaction after rescuing the horses and was happy that he could expose the black market.

The horses which vanished from Saddam’s palaces were used as donkeys to draw the carts. Each living being has its own intrinsic value. It may be Arabian horses or big cats; the black marketers were concerned only about how much they earn from it. “Animals as valuable as that would have been instantly seized by black marketers” (BA 173).

The thought of a unique breed of horses seemingly evaporating from the earth which kept buzzing about Anthony’s head like a mosquito. He wished the horses to be still alive and caged somewhere in the city. He found the horses with the support of the soldiers.

He remarked, “There’s no question these noble horses were absolutely intrinsic to the desert economy” (BA176).

Anthony and his team crossed so many hurdles and finally saved the horses, “The most important factor was that all the horses rescued in the mission survived; even the one with the injured leg recovered completely” (BA 185). Totally there were forty-

one horse but they could save only seventeen after which arose the question about the remaining horses. The remaining condition of the horses would have been, “Perhaps they have been sold on the black market; perhaps they are doing menial work such as dragging carts in rural areas; perhaps they are being raced at the Abu Ghraib racecourse. We don’t know. However, at least some of the gene pool of this priceless Mesopotamian bloodline has been saved” (BA 186).

Anthony did not only talk about the looting of animals which was rampant but also about the looters who looted during the wartime and even rampaged the household appliances. But no soldiers took action against them. This shows the future generation’s responsibility toward the nation. “Images of the wild rampage were beamed across the world. For those sitting in comfortable living rooms it was a cautionary glimpse into the darkness sprung tight beneath the veneer of human restraint” (BA 66). He learned a hard lesson in the war zone. It is the responsibility of each one to restore nature in its proper place. The governments, corporation, and organisations may provide funds, but it is the duty of individuals to implement it. The looters were not looting from the neighbours, they were looting their own planet.

I watched all of this with old, tired eyes. The symbolism was stark.

This wasn’t only about Baghdad; it wasn’t about Iraq. It was about all of us. It’s what we are doing to our planet. Looting it. (BA 66)

Amidst the war and bomb explosion, Anthony did not know how to react to overcome the tense situation. Then one of the soldiers gave him training to escape from the war. Due to the war, the city completely suffered. The strange thing was that with the lawlessness came a bizarre sense of independence. There were simply no regulations or

rulebooks. No government, administration, officials, police, electricity, traffic lights, shops, water, garbage removal functioned. No businesses were working, and nobody went to work because they were frightened of the situation. There was no constitutional order and everything was under lawlessness.

Every morning Anthony visited each animal individually, talking to them in gentle tones and comforting them. He entreated the animals that they would get food and water, that they were safe. There would be no more bombs or bullets in their home, and people who really cared for them were in charge. This depicts his relationship towards the animals. He spent each second to think about their future. He did everything he could do for their welfare. He did not support the concept of keeping wild animals caged. When he saw the television footage, he decided to do something to rescue the zoo animals and that was what he did there. He mentioned, "I was in Baghdad for the animals, not the zoo, but while I was there I would do everything, I could to help improve the facilities, bring Baghdad Zoo out of isolation, and connect Dr. Adel and his staff to the international fraternity of zoos" (BA 198). At the end, he handed over a functioning zoo with international sponsorship. Indeed, this was a mammoth achievement on the part of Anthony, as each living being is priceless.

According to intrinsic value theory of animals, the three forms of respect showed by various people and their dedication towards the welfare of the Baghdad Zoo animals should be appreciated. In the end, Anthony and other well-wishers considered it their real achievement,

Soon pumps were spurting water from the river Tigris into the park lakes, electricity was reconnected to the city's stuttering power grid, and the

mangled buildings were rebuilt. Burnt-out military trucks and other pulverized relics of war were towed away. The hundreds of lampposts, all of which had been unbolted and heaved over so looters could yank out the copper wire, were set straight once again. (BA 203)

The rehabilitated animals adapted to the new atmosphere. All the cages were clean as well as spacious for the animals to roam around freely. The outside of the cage was provided with sunshade to protect them from the harsh desert sun. They were fed healthy foods and the standard of hygiene also went up. Earlier there were the lions, tigers, badgers, a camel, a wolf, desert foxes, jackals, a lynx, rhesus monkeys, gazelles, wild pigs, boars, an Egyptian vulture, porcupines, hyenas, ostriches, eagles, cheetahs, a pelican, a swan, ducks, the original zoo bears, and the Luna Park dogs- which was unusual to be found in a zoo. Along with these zoo animals, there were Uday's lions, wounded ass bears, and the Last Man Standing.

Finally, the situation at the zoo changed for the better. It was a good time not only for the animals but also for the zoo staff as well. Adel and his staff were connected to international zoos and were paid highly. Through these international visits, they would learn about modern animal husbandry and veterinary techniques and about other famous universities. Slowly, the people of Baghdad also returned to their normal life. "Farmers were once again bringing in meat, vegetables, and other necessities to feed a hungry city, and the exotic bazaars bustled with thousands of buyers haggling noisily with merchants over price and quality" (BA 229).

The real achievement of Anthony, American soldiers, and zoo staff was to return a functioning zoo to the Iraqi people. Because of the zoo, many people got back their jobs

and were able to lead a happy family after the battle. The park is the symbolic representation of Iraqis freedom. “The park’s opening is symbolic of the new freedom in Iraq. The zoo is a place for the community to go and reflect on the meaning of life” (BA 231). After the war ended and the animals were safeguarded, Anthony went back to South Africa, he got a telephone call which informed him about the death of Bengal Tiger.

It is understandable that humans fail to grasp the basic beliefs that the existence of the future generation would be uncertain. But one thing is certain: anthropocentrism is not going to salvage the future. The only possible way to end the game is to change human attitude towards nature. “The most crucial lesson I learned in Baghdad was this: If “civilized” man is capable of routinely justifying such blatant abuse of trapped wildlife, what of the other unseen atrocities being inflicted on our planet?” (BA 237). The answer lies in individuals and it is high time to put an end to man’s atrocities towards nature.

In Ecosystems and Human Well-being: Synthesis stated that,

Over the past 50 years, humans have changed ecosystems more rapidly and extensively than in any comparable period of time in human history, largely to meet rapidly growing demands for food, fresh water, timber, fibre, and fuel. This has resulted in a substantial and largely irreversible loss in the diversity of life on Earth. (2)^[29]

In today’s strictly well-structured world, laws do not only tell what one cannot do but it similarly tells what one can do. Thus, Anthony proved what he could do. The Baghdad Zoo is a somber reminder of the dangers one encountered every moment of them lives. Each man’s survival depends on a change in one’s attitudes, no longer man can exploit voraciously the earth for his own purposes but needs to learn to value the limited

resources and respect his responsibility to safeguard and preserve the remaining resources for the future generations. This includes recognition of the fact that humans are just one of the species living on this planet, and the need to respect other living beings and nature in general. Never has this need for harmony and acceptance been more crucial than today.

The next chapter explores Anthony's adventures and his relationship with a rescued herd of African elephant which has been scrutinised using eight principles of deep ecology.

References

- [1] Stoop, Bert. "Discrimination between the intrinsic value of rare and common species". *Animal Freedom*. N. p. Web. 11 Jan 2016
- [2] MacKinnon, Barbara. *Ethics: Theory and Contemporary Issues*. 5th ed. U.S.A: Wadsworth Pub, 2006. Print.
- [3] Dol, Marcel. *Recognizing the Intrinsic Value of Animals: Beyond Animal Welfare*. Assen, The Netherlands: Van Gorcum, 1999. Print.
- [4] Regan, Tom. *The Case for Animal Rights*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004. Print.
- [5] Manning, Aubrey and Serpell, James. *Animals and Human Society: Changing Perspective*. London and NewYork: Routledge, 1994. Print.
- [6] "Coimbatore zoo animals feel the hunger pangs". *The Times of India*. 2018 Bennett, Coleman & Co. Ltd. 12 Aug 2012. Web. 2 Feb 2017.
- [7] Petre, Jonathan. "Lion of Kabul dies of old age after life spent in peril". *The Telegraph*. The Telegraph Media Group Limited. 27 Jan 2002. Web. 16 Feb 2017.
- [8] Singh, Vikram Jit. "Gandhi's Hoax Quote." *Hindustan Times*. N. p., 26 Oct. 2014. Web. 11 Mar. 2017.
- [9] Stewart, Noel. *Ethics: An Introduction to Moral Philosophy*. Cambridge, UK: Polity, 2009. Print.
- [10] Johnson, Clelly, "Prisoners in war: Zoos and Zoo Animals During Human Conflict 1870- 1947". *TigerPrints*. N.p., 2015. Web. 30 April 2017.

- [11] Johnson, Clelly, "Prisoners in war: Zoos and Zoo Animals During Human Conflict 1870- 1947". *TigerPrints*. N.p., 2015. Web. 30 April 2017.
- [12] Schopenhauer, Arthur. "The Basis of Morality". *Goodreads Inc*. N.p., 2017. Web. 3 March 2017.
- [13] Webb, Marcus. "The Lion, The Vets and The War Zone- Saving from Isis In Iraq And Syria". *The Slow Journalism Company*. Delayed Gratification. 10 April 2017. Web. 15 Dec 2017.
- [14] Cuny, Lynn Marie. *Through Animal's Eyes*. Texas: North Texas Press,1998. Print.
- [15] Malamud, Randy. *Poetic Animals and Animal Souls*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003. Print.
- [16] ---. *Poetic Animals and Animal Souls*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003. Print.
- [17] Vaughn, Lewis. *Doing Ethics: Moral Reasoning and Contemporary Issues*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 2010. Print.
- [18] Kiernan, Caitlin M. "The Worst Zoos on The Planet". *The dodo*. N.p., 15 Jan 2015. Web. 5 Mar 2017.
- [19] Odgaard, Lena. "Animals suffer in Gaza's cash-strapped zoos." *Al Jazeera.com*. Al Jazeera Media Network. 24 Aug 2015. Web. 23 Dec 2016.
- [20] Nader, Aya. "Viral video shines light on animal abuse at Giza Zoo". *Daily News Egypt*. N.p., 6 Aug, 2014. Web. 4 Mar, 2017.
- [21] Pressler, Margaret Webb. "Feeding Animals at National Zoo." *The Washington Post*. 1996- 2018 The Washington Post. 12 April 2011. Web. 25 March 2017.

- [22] Mthathiwa, Syned Dale Makani. "Human- Animal relationship and Ecocriticism: A study of the Representation of Animals in Poetry from Malawi, Zimbabwe, and South Africa." *Faculty of Humanities*, University of the Witwatersrand, 2011, 1-392. Print.
- [23] "Dachshund Pups Befriend Lonely Lion". *Cattime.com*. An Evolve Media, LLC company. 2018. Web. 17 Feb 2018.
- [24] Burns, John F. "Sarajevo Journal; In the Zoo's House of Horrors, One Pitiful Bear". *The New York Times*. The New York Times Company. 16 Oct, 1992. Web. 6 Dec 2016.
- [25] "Shocking Number of Animals Dying at Kiev Zoo". *Fox News Tech*. FOX News Network, LLC. 23 March 2011. Web. 11 Jan 2016.
- [26] Goulet, Krista. "Deontological Approach to Animal Rights". *Animal Rights (blogspot)*. N.p., 16 Dec 2012. Web. 14 Jan 2016.
- [27] Meeker, Joseph W. "The Comic Mode". *The Ecocriticism Reader: Landmarks in Literary Ecology*. Ed. Cheryll Glotfelty and Harold Fromm. Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1996. Print.
- [28] Manes, Christopher. "Nature and Silence". *The Ecocriticism Reader: Landmarks in Literary Ecology*. Ed. Cheryll Glotfelty and Harold Fromm. Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1996. Print.
- [29] Millennium Ecosystem Assessment. *Ecosystems and Human Well-being: Synthesis*. Washington: Island Press, 2005. Print.